Group Names: $\qquad$

## Georgia-Florida Football Rivalry Problem Set P-Hacking and Pitfalls of P-Values

The data below show the result of each game in the Georgia-Florida football rivalry from 1904 to 2015. Use this information to proceed through this problem set.

| Year | Winner | Year | Winner | Year | Winner |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| 1904 | Georgia | 1954 | Georgia | 1986 | Florida |
| 1915 | Georgia | 1955 | Florida | 1987 | Georgia |
| 1916 | Georgia | 1956 | Florida | 1988 | Georgia |
| 1919 | Georgia | 1957 | Florida | 1989 | Georgia |
| 1920 | Georgia | 1958 | Florida | 1990 | Florida |
| 1926 | Georgia | 1959 | Georgia | 1991 | Florida |
| 1927 | Georgia | 1960 | Florida | 1992 | Florida |
| 1928 | Florida | 1961 | Florida | 1993 | Florida |
| 1929 | Florida | 1962 | Florida | 1994 | Florida |
| 1930 | TIE | 1963 | Florida | 1995 | Florida |
| 1931 | Georgia | 1964 | Georgia | 1996 | Florida |
| 1932 | Georgia | 1965 | Florida | 1997 | Georgia |
| 1933 | Georgia | 1966 | Georgia | 1998 | Florida |
| 1934 | Georgia | 1967 | Florida | 1999 | Florida |
| 1935 | Georgia | 1968 | Georgia | 2000 | Florida |
| 1936 | Georgia | 1969 | TIE | 2001 | Florida |
| 1937 | Florida | 1970 | Florida | 2002 | Florida |
| 1938 | Georgia | 1971 | Georgia | 2003 | Florida |
| 1939 | Georgia | 1972 | Georgia | 2004 | Georgia |
| 1940 | Florida | 1973 | Florida | 2005 | Florida |
| 1941 | Georgia | 1974 | Georgia | 2006 | Florida |
| 1942 | Georgia | 1975 | Georgia | 2007 | Georgia |
| 1944 | Georgia | 1976 | Georgia | 2008 | Florida |
| 1945 | Georgia | 1977 | Florida | 2009 | Florida |
| 1946 | Georgia | 1978 | Georgia | 2010 | Florida |
| 1947 | Georgia | 1979 | Georgia | 2011 | Georgia |
| 1948 | Georgia | 1980 | Georgia | 2012 | Georgia |
| 1949 | Florida | 1981 | Georgia | 2013 | Georgia |
| 1950 | Georgia | 1982 | Georgia | 2014 | Florida |
| 1951 | Georgia | 1983 | Georgia | 2015 | Florida |
| 1952 | Florida | 1984 | Florida |  |  |
| 1953 | Florida | 1985 | Georgia |  |  |

$\qquad$

1. Start by examining the results of the first 30 games of the rivalry (from 1904 to 1951). Which team appears to be superior?

Superior team: $\qquad$
2. Suppose we want to examine if there is statistically significant evidence showing one team is superior to the other. Give the appropriate null and alternative hypotheses. (Hint: For the Null Hypothesis, what would the proportion of wins be for Georgia if two teams were evenly matched. Use a two-tailed one-proportion z-test.)

Let $\mathrm{p}=$ The proportion of games won by UGA
$\mathrm{H}_{0}$ : $\qquad$
$\mathrm{H}_{\mathrm{a}}$ : $\qquad$
3. Calculate the proportion of games won by Georgia in this 30 -year period. This will be the sample proportion.
$\hat{p}$ : $\qquad$
4. Assume the conditions for a 1-proprtion Z-test are met. Take a standard deck of playing cards and shuffle several times. Let the red cards represent Georgia wins, and let the black cards represent Georgia loses. Deal out 30 cards and count the number of Georgia wins (red cards). Calculate the proportion of Georgia wins. Repeat until you have a total of 10 proportions. Record those below.
5. Place your 10 proportions along with your classmates' on the dotplot on the board in the classroom. What proportion of dots on the dotplot were at the sample proportion ( $\hat{\mathrm{p}}$ ) or higher? Because this is a two-tailed test, double this proportion and this will be our simulated p-value.
6. Interpret the simulated $p$-value from above.
$\qquad$
7. Use your p-value to make a conclusion about the Georgia-Florida rivalry based off of this sample of the first 30 games.
8. One or more of the conditions for a 1-Proportion Z test were not met. Explain.
9. Do you feel that the conclusion from number 7 is valid? Why or why not?
10. Is it possible to get a random sample like this one where Georgia wins 24 of 30 games?
11. Now examine the results of the last 30 games of the rivalry (from 1986 to 2015). Which team appears to be superior?

Superior team:
12. Again, we want to see if there is statistically significant evidence showing one team is superior to the other. Give the appropriate null and alternative hypotheses. (Hint: For the Null Hypothesis, what would the proportion of wins be for Georgia if two teams were evenly matched. Use a two-tailed one-proportion z-test.)

Let $\mathrm{p}=$ The proportion of games won by Georgia
$\mathrm{H}_{0}$ : $\qquad$
$\mathrm{H}_{\mathrm{a}}$ : $\qquad$
$\qquad$
13. Calculate the proportion of games won by Georgia in this 30-year period. This will be the sample proportion.
$\hat{p}$ : $\qquad$
14. Assume the conditions for a 1-proprtion Z-test are met. Look at the previously constructed dotplot on the board in the classroom. What proportion of dots on the dotplot were at the sample proportion ( $\hat{\mathrm{p}}$ ) or higher? Because this is a two-tailed test, double this proportion and this will be our simulated $p$-value.
15. Interpret the simulated p-value from above.
16. Use your p-value to make a conclusion about the Georgia-Florida rivalry based off of this sample of the last 30 games.
17. Do you feel that the conclusion from number 16 is valid? Why or why not?
18. Is it possible to get a random sample like this one where Florida wins 21 of 30 games?
19. Compare and contrast the results of this sample and the first sample.
$\qquad$
20. Now use technology to generate a simple random sample of 30 games from the rivalry. The games haven been numbered in the table below.

| Year | Winner | Year | Winner | Year | Winner |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| $1904(1)$ | Georgia | $1954(33)$ | Georgia | $1986(65)$ | Florida |
| $1915(2)$ | Georgia | $1955(34)$ | Florida | $1987(66)$ | Georgia |
| $1916(3)$ | Georgia | $1956(35)$ | Florida | $1988(67)$ | Georgia |
| $1919(4)$ | Georgia | $1957(36)$ | Florida | $1989(68)$ | Georgia |
| $1920(5)$ | Georgia | $1958(37)$ | Florida | $1990(69)$ | Florida |
| $1926(6)$ | Georgia | $1959(38)$ | Georgia | $1991(70)$ | Florida |
| $1927(7)$ | Georgia | $1960(39)$ | Florida | $1992(71)$ | Florida |
| $1928(8)$ | Florida | $1961(40)$ | Florida | $1993(72)$ | Florida |
| $1929(9)$ | Florida | $1962(41)$ | Florida | $1994(73)$ | Florida |
| $1930(10)$ | TIE | $1963(42)$ | Florida | $1995(74)$ | Florida |
| $1931(11)$ | Georgia | $1964(43)$ | Georgia | $1996(75)$ | Florida |
| $1932(12)$ | Georgia | $1965(44)$ | Florida | $1997(76)$ | Georgia |
| $1933(13)$ | Georgia | $1966(45)$ | Georgia | $1998(77)$ | Florida |
| $1934(14)$ | Georgia | $1967(46)$ | Florida | $1999(78)$ | Florida |
| $1935(15)$ | Georgia | $1968(47)$ | Georgia | $2000(79)$ | Florida |
| $1936(16)$ | Georgia | $1969(48)$ | TIE | $2001(80)$ | Florida |
| $1937(17)$ | Florida | $1970(49)$ | Florida | $2002(81)$ | Florida |
| $1938(18)$ | Georgia | $1971(50)$ | Georgia | $2003(82)$ | Florida |
| $1939(19)$ | Georgia | $1972(51)$ | Georgia | $2004(83)$ | Georgia |
| $1940(20)$ | Florida | $1973(52)$ | Florida | $2005(84)$ | Florida |
| $1941(21)$ | Georgia | $1974(53)$ | Georgia | $2006(85)$ | Florida |
| $1942(22)$ | Georgia | $1975(54)$ | Georgia | $2007(86)$ | Georgia |
| $1944(23)$ | Georgia | $1976(55)$ | Georgia | $2008(87)$ | Florida |
| $1945(24)$ | Georgia | $1977(56)$ | Florida | $2009(88)$ | Florida |
| $1946(25)$ | Georgia | $1978(57)$ | Georgia | $2010(89)$ | Florida |
| $1947(26)$ | Georgia | $1979(58)$ | Georgia | $2011(90)$ | Georgia |
| $1948(27)$ | Georgia | $1980(59)$ | Georgia | $2012(91)$ | Georgia |
| $1949(28)$ | Florida | $1981(60)$ | Georgia | $2013(92)$ | Georgia |
| $1950(29)$ | Georgia | $1982(61)$ | Georgia | $2014(93)$ | Florida |
| $1951(30)$ | Georgia | $1983(62)$ | Georgia | $2015(94)$ | Florida |
| $1952(31)$ | Florida | $1984(63)$ | Florida |  |  |
| $1953(32)$ | Florida | $1985(64)$ | Georgia |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 192 |  |  |  |  |  |

$\qquad$
21. Suppose we want to see if there is statistically significant evidence showing one team is superior to the other. Give the appropriate null and alternative hypotheses. (Hint: For the Null Hypothesis, what would the proportion of wins be for Georgia if two teams were evenly matched. Use a two-tailed one-proportion z-test.)

Let $\mathrm{p}=$ The proportion of games won by Georgia
$\mathrm{H}_{0}$ : $\qquad$
$\mathrm{H}_{\mathrm{a}}$ : $\qquad$
22. Calculate the proportion of games won by Georgia in the simple random sample. Once again, this will be our sample proportion.
$\hat{p}$ : $\qquad$
23. Assume the conditions for a 1-proprtion Z-test are met. Look at the previously constructed dotplot on the board in the classroom. What proportion of dots on the dotplot were at the sample proportion ( $\hat{p}$ ) or higher? Because this is a two-tailed test, double this proportion and this will be our simulated p-value.
24. Interpret the simulated p-value from above.
25. Are all of the conditions for a 1-Proportion Z-test met? Explain.
$\qquad$
26. Use your p-value to make a conclusion about the Georgia-Florida rivalry based off of this random sample of 30 games.
27. Does this conclusion differ from your previous two conclusions? If so, how does it differ?
28. So far you have looked at three different samples of 30 games from the rivalry. Now examine the results of all 94 games. Calculate the proportion of games won by Georgia in this 94 -year period. This will be the sample proportion.
$\hat{p}$ : $\qquad$
29. Suppose we want to examine if there is statistically significant evidence showing one team is superior to the other. Give the appropriate null and alternative hypotheses. (Hint: For the Null Hypothesis, what would the proportion of wins be for Georgia if two teams were evenly matched. Use a two-tailed one-proportion z-test.)

Let $\mathrm{p}=$ The proportion of games won by Georgia
$\mathrm{H}_{0}$ : $\qquad$
$\mathrm{H}_{\mathrm{a}}$ : $\qquad$
30. Assume the conditions for a 1-proprtion Z-test are met. Calculate the z -score and p-value for these 94 games.
z-score: $\qquad$
p-value: $\qquad$
$\qquad$
31. Use your $p$-value to make a conclusion to determine if one team is superior in the GeorgiaFlorida rivalry based off of this sample of 94 games.
32. Type I Error is defined to be incorrectly rejecting the null hypothesis. It is possible to collect a sample that leads to statistically significant results in error. Which of the first 3 samples in this activity are examples of Type I Error? Also, explain Type I Error in the context of this problem.
33. Reflect on the different results the came from these four data sets and their resulting $p$ values. What does this reveal about statistical significance, $p$-values, and errors in conclusions based off of sampling?

